



**Metro**


Metropolitan Transportation Authority


One Gateway Plaza  
Los Angeles, CA 90012-2952

213.922.2000 Tel  
metro.net

January 19, 2007

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

THROUGH: ROGER SNOBLE  
CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER 

FROM: RUTHE HOLDEN  
CHIEF AUDITOR, MANAGEMENT AUDIT SERVICES 

SUBJECT: STATUS OF OPEN AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS AS OF  
NOVEMBER 30, 2006

### ISSUE

At the March 2005 Executive Management and Audit Committee meeting, the committee requested that the status of all open audit recommendations be reported monthly. This includes audits performed by Management Audit Services (MAS) and, in compliance with MAS 1, external audits performed by outside auditors.

### DISCUSSION

MAS' monthly audit follow-up report includes all open audit recommendations related to findings reported by Financial Audit, Information Technology (IT) Audit, Operational Audit, and outside auditors; statistics on the number of recommendations closed or completed since the last report; and a summary of audit activities in Contract Audit and Grant Audit.

During the month of November 2006, MAS issued one report, Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security (06-MRL-002), which contained ten recommendations. One recommendation has been closed and the other recommendations are included in Attachment A as items 34 through 42.

Nine of the open recommendations were closed or completed during November. Nine recommendations have a status of "under review." This indicates that the audit client has submitted documentation that is being analyzed to verify that all of the recommended actions are complete. We are actively working with staff to close each recommendation as quickly as possible. The total open recommendations as of November 30, 2006 are included in Attachment A.

The following table summarizes the follow-up activity for audit recommendations during November 2006.

Table 1  
Summary of Financial, IT, Operational and External Audit Recommendations  
As of November 30, 2006

Executive Area	Closed or Completed	Under Review	Extended	Not Yet Due	Total Open Recom.
EO Finance			2	1	3
EO Administration				4	4
EO Procurement & Material Management	2	2	5		7
Chief Executive Officer	1	2	1		3
Chief Comm. Officer	3	4		1	5
Chief Planning Officer	1			11	11
DCEO/COO	2	1	8	13	22
Totals	9	9	16	30	55

Contract Audit conducts audits related to pre-awards, change orders, and incurred costs, as well as providing support for claims, contract closeouts and contract related litigation. Grant Audit conducts closeout audits of projects funded by the Call-for-Projects.

During November 2006, one audit was closed for the Contract Audit group, and 23 audit reports remain open pending the results of negotiations. Grant Audit issued two final reports and had five audit reports in the draft audit stage.

#### NEXT STEPS

Management Audit Services will provide the next monthly status report for the period ending December 31, 2006.

Attachment A: Open Audit Recommendations Report

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

Attachment A

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
1	06-AUD-06	6/7/2006	OIG	Review of Overtime Payments	EO Finance/Payroll, OD&T	2a	Based on the results of the task force, the Payroll Department should initiate any necessary actions to provide additional training and/or guidance to timekeepers and supervisors to ensure that timekeeping for overtime is consistent.	11/30/2006	2/28/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
2	06-AUD-06	6/7/2006	OIG	Review of Overtime Payments	EO Finance/Payroll, IT	2b	Based on the results of the task force, the Payroll Department should initiate any necessary actions to, if needed, work with the Information Technology Services Department to develop a computerized edit check in the Payroll System to identify instances where the overtime requirements have not been followed.	10/31/2006	2/28/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
3	02-AUD-05	9/30/2002	OIG	Controls Over Payroll System - Preventing Duplicate Payments	EO Finance/Finance	3	Ensure that the new Payroll System is designed with controls and edit checks that preclude incorrect and improper data from being processed into the Payroll System.	1/1/2008		New payroll system is on hold until 2008.
4	06-AUD-12	9/15/2006	OIG	Disposal of Computer Equipment and Data Storage Media	EO Administration	2	The Chief Information Officer should coordinate with Records Management to resolve the conflict with Policy GEN 8, which states that only Records Management Center staff are authorized to delete or destroy public records, including erasing data from hard drives.	12/31/2006		
5	06-AUD-12	9/15/2006	OIG	Disposal of Computer Equipment and Data Storage Media	EO Administration	4	The Director, General Services, should coordinate with ITS to revise Policy GEN 8 to establish specific procedures for destroying unneeded or damaged electronic storage media.	12/31/2006		
6	06-AUD-12	9/15/2006	OIG	Disposal of Computer Equipment and Data Storage Media	EO Administration	5	The Director, General Services should revise Policy GEN 8 to include a definition of the term "public records" cited in the policy.	12/31/2006		
7	06-AUD-12	9/15/2006	OIG	Disposal of Computer Equipment and Data Storage Media	EO Administration	6	The Director, General Services, should Inform LACMTA departments and staff of the requirement in Policy GEN 8 to turn in applicable electronic storage media to the Records Management Center.	1/31/2007		
8	06-ITS-010	6/1/2006	MAS	Information Technology Services Disaster Recovery Plan	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./ITS	1.1	MAS recommends that the CIO develop, for its Steering Committee review, a cost/benefit analysis identifying the resources needed to conduct a test of all seven mission critical systems versus the risk of not conducting such a test within the timeframe specified by the DRP and EPP. The cost/benefit analysis should include an evaluation whether all seven mission critical systems need to be recovered within 72-hours.	11/30/2006		Under review.
9	06-AUD-02	2/9/2006	OIG	Review of Contract Administration Functions	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./Procurement	2a	Create a title (such as Contracting Officer's Technical Representative) for employees who are delegated contract administration responsibilities but are not Project Managers.	6/30/2006	3/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
10	06-AUD-02	2/9/2006	OIG	Review of Contract Administration Functions	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./Procurement	2b	Revise the Procurement Policy Manual to clarify who is ultimately responsible for assuring that delegated contract administration functions are properly carried out. The clarification should address any differences in those responsibilities between Project Managers and other employees who are delegated contract administration responsibilities.	6/30/2006	3/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
11	06-AUD-02	2/9/2006	OIG	Review of Contract Administration Functions	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./Procurement	2c	Ensure that Contracting Officers prepare written delegations whenever contract administration functions are delegated to qualified employees.	6/30/2006	3/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

Attachment A

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
12	06-AUD-02	2/9/2006	OIG	Review of Contract Administration Functions	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./Procurement	2d	Develop a Delegation of Authority Form to ensure that the contract administration responsibilities delegated and the limitations of the delegated authority are clearly defined. Also, ensure that appropriate Procurement officials approve the delegations, and the delegations are appropriately maintained on file.	6/30/2006	3/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
13	TCBA-M3-05	12/1/2005	MAS (O)	Report on the Implementation and Acquisition of the M3 System	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./ITS	9.1	We recommend that for future fixed-price contracts similar to M3, which involve very significant expenditures over a multi-year period for hardware delivery and software development, LACMTA should establish contract payment provisions linked to verifiable performance milestones. Progress payment schedules should also be modified as contract modifications are negotiated. For the M3 project, Spear was required to, among other requirements, deliver and install various hardware and software items, adapt its system to LACMTA needs, provide work documentation for the various departments and functions, train LACMTA staff, develop test scripts, test the implementation, and roll out the system in various LACMTA departments. Payment should have been linked to such verifiable performance/deliverable items.	6/30/2006	3/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
14	02IT-003	4/30/2003	MAS	LAN - Windows NT/ 2000	EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt./ITS	1.1	Enforce password complexity requirements in Windows 2000 operating system.	1/31/2004	11/30/2006	Under review.
15	06-AUD-06	6/7/2006	OIG	Review of Overtime Payments	CEO/Task Force headed by EO Finance	1a	We recommend that the Chief Executive Officer form a task force to evaluate the procedures for payment of overtime to union employees.	11/30/2006		Under review.
16	06-AUD-06	6/7/2006	OIG	Review of Overtime Payments	CEO/Task Force headed by EO Finance	1b	We recommend that the Chief Executive Officer form a task force to ensure the overtime payments are consistent and equitable.	11/30/2006		Under review.
17	06-AUD-06	6/7/2006	OIG	Review of Overtime Payments	CEO/EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt.	1c	We recommend that the Chief Executive Officer form a task force to establish controls to ensure that overtime is paid in accordance with applicable laws, policies, and union agreements.	10/31/2006	2/28/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
18	06-AUD-11	7/26/2006	OIG	Controls Over the Metro Rewards Program	CCO	1a	Strengthen controls over the Metro Rewards Program by requiring that periodic audits be made of the Program.	1/30/2007		
19	06-AUD-11	7/26/2006	OIG	Controls Over the Metro Rewards Program	CCO	1b	Strengthen controls over the Metro Rewards Program by increasing oversight and management reviews of the Program administration.	8/31/2006		Under review.
20	06-AUD-11	7/26/2006	OIG	Controls Over the Metro Rewards Program	CCO	3	Require staff to assess the current inventory level of each type of gift card, determine ideal inventory level based on forecast usage over the next six months, and purchase additional cards only when needed.	8/31/2006		Under review.
21	06-CMS-006	5/25/2006	MAS	Rail Vehicles and Facilities Leasing to the Entertainment Industry	CCO/Public Relations	1	Monitoring performance can help minimize the risks associated with one person performing key duties. Monitoring should occur continuously and includes supervisory activities such as: periodically verifying that all sequentially pre-numbered contracts are accounted for; comparing and reconciling the production company names and revenue amounts entered into the Public Relations Excel spreadsheets to spreadsheets provided by Accounting; and comparing Rail leasing event confirmations and cancellations to Public Relations records.	8/15/2006		Under review.

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
22	06-CMS-006	5/25/2006	MAS	Rail Vehicles and Facilities Leasing to the Entertainment Industry	CCO/Public Relations	2	All transactions, including cancellations and public service projects, should be accounted for and supported even when not entered into the financial records. Using sequentially pre-numbered contracts and maintaining the files in sequence as well as listing them in the same order in the Excel spreadsheets could accomplish this. In addition, receipts provided by Treasury should be part of the documentation to provide evidence that payments were submitted for deposit and recorded in the financial records. All cancelled and Public Service transactions should be signed off by Public Relations management to verify that no funds were involved in that transaction or that the event was actually cancelled.	8/15/2006		Under review.
23	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	1.1	We recommend that LACMTA develop a clear mission statement identifying the purpose of the program, its intended clients, and establish detailed criteria on program eligibility.	6/30/2007		
24	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	2.1	We recommend that LACMTA coordinate its effort under the INTP with other social service agencies that provide transportation services once it has developed a clear mission statement and client population.	6/30/2007		
25	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	3.1	We recommend LACMTA consider significantly reducing or eliminating the \$7 taxi voucher program, but maintain the variable taxi voucher program for emergency transportation needs only.	6/30/2007		
26	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	4.2	We also recommend that LACMTA consider conducting a one-time full audit of taxi vouchers to identify those cab companies that are abusing the taxi voucher program by overcharging for taxi fares. The LACMTA should then seek reimbursement for the overcharges.	6/30/2007		
27	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	5.1	We recommend that administrative fees paid to the brokers should be reassessed after changes to the program have been made.	6/30/2007		
28	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	6.1	We recommend that FAME establish a consistent methodology for allocating indirect expenses to programs based on personnel cost or other equitable allocation methods.	6/30/2007		
29	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	7.1	We recommend that FAME personnel prepare timesheets detailing the hours worked by program and other activities.	6/30/2007		
30	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	8.1	We recommend that LACMTA and the brokers work together to educate distributing agencies about other transportation programs available and encourage them to direct clients to those services before INTP benefits are distributed.	6/30/2007		
31	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	9.1	We recommend that LACMTA consider outsourcing the responsibility of taxi administration to mitigate LACMTA's risk against unlicensed or uninsured taxicab drivers.	6/30/2007		

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
32	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	10.1	While outside the scope of this study, we recommend that the INTP program begin to investigate how it will adapt to LACMTA's future use of SMART cards to the preclusion of bus tokens. Because of the cost of individual an individual SMART Card, LACMTA will need to determine how it will be able to distribute relatively small numbers of bus trips to large numbers of clients.	6/30/2007		
33	06-INTP-TCBA	5/10/2006	MAS (O)	Report on the Immediate Needs Transportation Program (INTP)	CPO/Planning	11.1	LACMTA should consider soliciting bids for the administration of the INTP program, but not until the program requirements are more well-defined and decisions on changes to the program have been made.	6/30/2007		
34	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.1	To strengthen the management of user accounts, the DEO of Rail Operations should disable or remove all unnecessary, guest, and generic accounts.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
35	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.2	To strengthen the management of user accounts, the DEO of Rail Operations should establish individual accounts with specific privileges for each system and database administrator (DBA), rather than relying on the generic Superadmin account.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
36	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.3	To strengthen the management of user accounts, the DEO of Rail Operations should implement audit trails to track changes being made in the system,	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
37	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.4	To strengthen the management of user accounts, the DEO of Rail Operations should establish monitoring mechanisms to detect unauthorized and illegale acts and to monitor remote users.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
38	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.5	To strengthen the management of user accounts, the DEO of Rail Operations should establis a process for issuing, closing, reviewing and monitoring user accounts. Reviews should periodically examine the levels of acces to ensure conformity with the principle of least privilege and removal of terminated and inactive accounts.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
39	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	2.1	To improve password security, the DEO Rail Operations should establish unique identification and robust passwords for Superadmin account members.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
40	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	2.2	To improve password security, the DEO Rail Operations should require periodic changes of passwords to reduce the risk of unauthorized access.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
41	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	3.1	We recommend that the DEO Rail Operations establish a separate ATMS test environment to protect the production system and delete the existing generic and test accounts.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
42	06-MRL-002	11/29/2006	MAS	Audit of Advanced Transit Management System Security	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	4.1	We recommend that the DEO Rail Operations improve the physical and environmental security within the data center by a) working with Facilities Maintenance to provide a solution to the potential water leak from the floor above, b) identifying the location of shut off valves and developing procedures that should be followed in the event of failure, c) providing a backup air conditioner, d) installing appropriate sensors and/or alarms and consider closed circuit monitoring of the data center, and e) replacing the server doors panels.	3/31/2007		New audit. Working with management on action plan.
43	06-CVS-008	10/27/2006	MAS	Fare Media Process	DCEO Operations	1	MAS recommends that Operations strengthen and enforce controls over day pass books to reduce the number of day pass books that cannot be located at the end of the day. The controls may be manual or automated. However, control selection should be based on a cost/benefit analysis, which recognizes that the new Transit Access Pass (TAP) will replace the current day pass system within the next two years.	1/31/2007		
44	03-IA-017	8/29/2006	MAS	Bus Operators OCB/VCB Assignments at San Fernando Valley Sector	DCEO Operations	2	The DCEO should work with Manpower Planning, ITS and County Counsel to develop a timely summary report that is issued to the Division Transportation Managers to provide them with information to monitor the 80 hours on-duty limitation.	12/31/2006		
45	03-IA-017	8/29/2006	MAS	Bus Operators OCB/VCB Assignments at San Fernando Valley Sector	DCEO Operations	3	The DCEO should analyze whether a warning notification can be programmed into TOTS to provide the schedulers with instant notification as they are setting up assignments to ensure operators will not exceed the limitations for on-duty time.	12/31/2006		
46	06-SEC-01	6/26/2006	MAS	Gateway Building Security	DCEO Operations	2	Security sensitive	12/31/2006	7/30/2007	Two recommendations closed, and one open recommendation extended.
47	06-SEC-09	6/26/2006	MAS	Division and RRC Security	DCEO Operations	1	Security sensitive	12/31/2006		One recommendation closed, and one open recommendation in the process of being implemented.
48	06-ITS-017	1/23/2006	MAS	ATMS Disaster Recovery Plan	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	1.2	Evaluate and implement an alternative backup location designated for recovery.	6/30/2006	6/30/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
49	06-ITS-017	1/23/2006	MAS	ATMS Disaster Recovery Plan	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	2.1	We recommend the Deputy Chief Executive Officer to review and revise the existing draft procedure incorporating COBIT's list of recommendations where applicable, and formalize a complete ATMS DRP.	6/30/2006	6/30/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
50	06-ITS-017	1/23/2006	MAS	ATMS Disaster Recovery Plan	DCEO Operations/Transit Systems Engineering	2.2	Transit Systems Engineering [shall] perform a cost analysis to determine what would be the most cost effective alternative for an alternate ATMS recovery location. The three options to consider are 1) include the ATMS system in the Information Technology Services SunGard contract, 2) setting up a contingent site at one of the LACMTA facilities, or 3) contracting with a hot-site solely for the ATMS recovery.	6/30/2006	6/30/2007	On target to meet extended due date.

**All Open Audit Recommendations  
Status as of November 30, 2006**

Attachment A

No.	Report Number	Report Date	Audit Entity	Title	Exec Area	Rec No	Recommendation	Original Completion Date	Extended Completion Date	Comments
51	TCBA-M3-05	12/1/2005	MAS (O)	Report on the Implementation and Acquisition of the M3 System	DCEO Operations	2.1	We recommend that at the completion of the initial implementation of the M3 System, LACMTA should conduct a post implementation review within six months to determine whether the system requirements Spear disclosed in their proposal that they could not fully meet are needed by user groups to achieve optimal functionality. A cost-benefit analysis should also be performed before deciding on any upgrade to system requirements.	9/30/2006	12/31/2006	On target to meet extended due date.
52	031A-009	3/4/2004	MAS	Operators Work Time Requirements	DCEO Operations	1.3	Update the Operator's Rulebook and Standard Operating Procedures to reflect current practices.	7/31/2004	1/31/2007	On target to meet extended due date.
53	031A-009	3/4/2004	MAS	Operators Work Time Requirements	DCEO Ops./EO Proc. & Mat. Mgmt. (ITS)	1.2	Work with the ITS department to generate a report showing actual driving time.	7/31/2004	6/30/2006	Under review
54	Booz-Allen 1	8/31/2001	Booz-Allen	LACMTA Management Audit	DCEO Operations	W05	Review job descriptions and ensure they reflect physical and agility job requirements.	3/29/2002	12/31/2006	On target to meet extended due date.
55	01-AUD-03	6/12/2001	OIG	Payroll and Overtime Controls in the ATOS Program	DCEO Operations	10	Request MAS to perform an audit of payroll procedures within the Department to ensure that internal controls are adequate.	6/20/2001	6/30/2007	On target to meet extended due date.