

**14**REGULAR BOARD MEETING  
DECEMBER 4, 2003**14**Metropolitan  
Transportation  
Authority**SUBJECT: TOW TRACTORS****ACTION: AWARD CONTRACT FOR TOW TRACTORS**One Gateway Plaza  
Los Angeles, CA  
90012-2952**RECOMMENDATION**

Authorize the Chief Executive Officer to award a firm fixed-price contract under Bid No. 03-0035 with Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing, the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for seven tow tractors in an amount of \$261,824, inclusive of sales tax.

**RATIONALE**

Tow tractors are an essential part of daily maintenance operations. The operating divisions utilize these vehicles throughout the three operating shifts to push and/or tow buses that cannot move under their own power within the yards and shops.

The old tow tractors to be replaced were designed to tow and pull heavy loads. They were configured so that most of the vehicle's weight rests on its rear axle, which allows the wheels to stay on the ground and pull heavy loads. Although they were designed to pull, the MTA uses these vehicles 80% of the time to push buses around. As a result, there has been a continual breakage of the front suspension system and steering on this equipment.

The new tow tractors to be purchased are designed to both tow and push heavy loads. This type of tractor was not manufactured nine years ago when the original tractors were purchased. The weight of these tow tractors is distributed evenly throughout the vehicle, which allows the front suspension to handle heavy pushing. These new tow tractors are configured for our specific duty cycle and will be at a much lower level of operating cost to the MTA.

The tow tractors to be replaced were purchased in 1994 and have been in service for nine continuous years. The FTA replacement criterion of five years has been exceeded by four years and the MTA criterion of seven years has been exceeded by two years. The MTA has established a longer replacement cycle in order to extend the life of the fleet and to minimize replacement costs.

Currently, there are 13 tow tractors in our fleet of this particular type. All 13 tow tractors are in the same state of deterioration and are all scheduled for replacement. This procurement will replace the first seven that are experiencing the highest maintenance costs and are in the worst physical condition. The six other tow tractors are scheduled for replacement in the FY05 capital replacement plan. The seven replaced tow tractors will be salvaged in accordance with MTA equipment salvage policies and procedures.

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

Funding of \$261,824 for this procurement is included in the FY04 budget of cost center 3434, Non-Revenue, under project number 200010, Non-revenue Vehicle and Equipment, line item number 53102, Acquisition of Equipment, and task number 03.21 identified in CP3908038.

### **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

The alternative is to not purchase this equipment and continue using the existing fleet. This alternative is not recommended because these vehicles have been utilized beyond their designed capabilities and would require significant costs to maintain. Additionally, the manufacturer of this vehicle has gone out of business and the availability of replacement parts is difficult to acquire. These parts, when acquired, are at a considerably higher cost, making these vehicles very expensive to maintain. Parts that are not available are manufactured for the MTA at an even higher cost.

### **ATTACHMENTS**

- A. Procurement Summary
- A-1. Procurement History
- A-2. List of Subcontractors
- B. Bid Tabulation

Prepared by: Otto Ojong, Buyer  
Harold Torres, Equipment Maintenance Supervisor

*Carolyn Flannery for*

---

John B. Catoe, Jr.  
Deputy Chief Executive Officer

*[Signature]*

---

Roger Snoble  
Chief Executive Officer

**BOARD REPORT ATTACHMENT A  
PROCUREMENT SUMMARY**

**TOW TRACTORS**

1.	Contract Number: 03-0035		
2.	Recommended Vendor: Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing, Anaheim, California		
3.	Cost/Price Analysis Information:		
	A. Bid/Proposed Price: \$261,824	Estimated Amount: \$330,750	
	B. Details of Significant Variances are in Attachment A-1.D		
4.	Contract Type: Fixed Price		
5.	Procurement Dates:		
	A. Issued: 8/12/03		
	B. Advertised: 8/13/03		
	C. Pre-proposal Conference: N/A		
	D. Proposals Due: 9/23/03		
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: Yes		
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: Yes		
6.	Small Business Participation:		
	A. Bid/Proposal Goal: 0%	Date Small Business Evaluation Completed: N/A	
	B. Small Business Commitment: N/A		
7.	Invitation for Bid/Request for Proposal Data:		
	Notifications Sent: 24	Bids/Proposals Picked up: 6	Bids/Proposals Received: 4
8.	Evaluation Information:		
	<b>Bidders/Proposers Names:</b>  1. Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing 2. Eagle Industrial 3. Loadstar Material Handling 4. NMC-Wollard	<b>Bid/Proposal Amount:</b>  \$261,824 \$272,676 \$283,838 \$301,713	<b>Best and Final Offer Amount: N/A</b>
	B. Evaluation Methodology: Selection of the lowest responsive, responsible bidder.		
9.	Protest Information:		
	A. Protest Period End Date: 11/25/03		
	B. Protest Receipt Date: TBD		
	C. Disposition of Protest Date: TBD		
10.	Contract Administrator: Otto Ojong	Telephone Number: 213-922-1454	
11.	Project Manager: Harold Torres	Telephone Number: 562-658-0231	

**BOARD REPORT ATTACHMENT A-1  
PROCUREMENT HISTORY**

**TOW TRACTORS**

**A. Background on Contractor**

The responsive and responsible low bidder, Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing, is located in Anaheim, California, and has been in the commercial and industrial vehicle business since 1949. Taylor-Dunn has provided a broad line of electric and gas powered personnel, burden, and tow vehicles to other agencies including the U.S. Postal Service, Pentagon, County USC Medical Center, and U.S. Naval Hospitals. In the past, Taylor-Dunn has provided satisfactory service to the MTA.

**B. Procurement Background**

In accordance with the MTA Procurement Policies and Procedures, Vehicle Technology performed a technical evaluation of four bids that were received. The low bid submitted by Taylor-Dunn was determined to be in full compliance with the specifications.

The tow tractors are scheduled to be delivered after receipt of order in early April 2004. Warranty is for a period of three-years, or the manufacturer's standard warranty, whichever is greater.

**C. Evaluation of Proposals**

Technical review and selection of the lowest responsive, responsible bidder.

Bidder #1 Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing in the amount of \$261,824 was found to be responsive and in full compliance with the technical specifications.

Bidder #2 Eagle Industrial in the amount of \$272,676 was found to be non-responsive and not in full compliance with the technical specifications since they did not submit an approved equal request for the air compressor component.

Bidder #3 Loadstar Material Handling in the amount of \$283,838 was found to be responsive and in full compliance with the technical specifications.

Bidder #4 NMC-Wollard in the amount of \$301,713 was found to be non-responsive and not in compliance with the technical specifications since they had offered a non pre-approved model.

D. Cost/Price Analysis Explanation of Variances

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon adequate price competition and selection of the lowest responsive and responsible bidder.

**Table 1 Analysis**

<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>MTA Estimate</b>	<b>Recommended Amount</b>
\$261,824.30	\$330,750	\$261,824

**Table 2 Analysis**

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Quantity</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Bid Unit Price</b>	<b>Historical Unit Price</b>	<b>Price Variance</b>
Taylor-Dunn	7 each	Tiger TIG-60	\$34,552.86	\$37,458	(\$2,905.14)
				(7/22/03)	

**BOARD REPORT ATTACHMENT A-2  
LIST OF SUBCONTRACTORS**

**TOW TRACTORS**

**PRIME CONTRACTOR**

Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing

**Small Business Commitment**

0% Bid Goal

**Total Commitment**            0%

**Other Subcontractors**

None

**BOARD REPORT ATTACHMENT B  
 BID TABULATION**

**TOW TRACTORS**

Bids Out: 8/12/03 Total: 24  
 Bids Opened: 9/23/03 Total: 4  
 Adv. Date: 8/13/03  
 Newspaper: La Opinion, LA Sentinel,  
 Daily News

Item	Description	Qty	Taylor-Dunn Mfg. Inc.		Eagle Industrial		Loadstar Material Handling		NMC-Wollard	
			Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension
1	Tow Tractors	7	\$34,552.86	\$241,870.02	\$35,985.00	\$251,895.00	\$37,458.00	\$262,206.00	\$39,817.00	\$278,719.00
	Subtotal			\$241,870.02		\$251,895.00		\$262,206.00		\$278,719.00
	Sales Tax			\$19,954.28		\$20,781.34		\$21,632.00		\$22,994.32
	8.25%									
	Total Bid			\$261,824.30		\$272,676.34		\$283,838.00		\$301,713.32

I hereby certify Taylor-Dunn Manufacturing as being the lowest responsible bidder and recommend award to them for a total price, including sales tax, of \$261,824.

11/3/03  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 Date

  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 Signature