



Los Angeles County  
Metropolitan  
Transportation  
Authority

One Gateway Plaza  
Los Angeles, CA  
90012

213.922.6000

May 14, 1997

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: LINDA BOHLINGER,  
INTERIM CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

SUBJECT: APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AWARD TO MODERNIZE  
THREE METRO BLUE LINE ELEVATORS

**RECOMMENDATION**

Consider Interim Chief Executive Officer's report containing a recommendation to award a contract to Montgomery KONE, Inc., the lowest responsible and responsive bidder to IFB No. OP35600711, to modernize three hydraulic elevators at the Blue Line Slauson, Firestone and Del Amo Stations, for a total amount of \$492,777.

**ORGANIZATIONAL IMPACT**

This action will allow Metro Blue Line elevators to operate safely and smoothly to the satisfaction of transit system patrons.

**BUDGET IMPACT**

Funds for this project are contained in FTA Grant No. CA-03-0430 and are included in the FY 1997/98 Operations Department Capital Budget.

**ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

Alternatives considered but not recommended, include:

- Replace vandalized glass panels, metal cladding and fixtures only. This option will cost less in the short run but will not address the deteriorating structural and mechanical conditions of the elevators or compliance with code changes arising from the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA).
- Upgrade the equipment to comply with recent code changes only. This option will not appreciably solve all the problems inherent in the design of the units.

## **BACKGROUND**

The Metro Blue Line elevators at Slauson, Firestone and Del Amo Stations have sustained extensive vandalism since revenue service began in 1989. Elevator cladding and glass panels are defaced from constant graffiti tags and etching by vandals. The fixtures, which are not vandal resistant, are either worn, damaged or missing. In addition, urination inside the elevator cars has resulted in considerable corrosion to the flooring, substructures and frames. Code changes in ADA, enacted after the units were installed, have rendered these units non-compliant. MTA has upgraded elevator cab design specification for train Red and Green Line stations by incorporating the lessons learned from Blue Line elevator problems.

Modernization of the elevators is necessary to replace vandalized components and to bring the units into compliance with recent codes. The recommended upgrades will extend the life of the equipment by minimizing vandalism and corrosion damage. The elevators are currently in deplorable condition and reflect badly on the MTA.

IFB No. OP35600711 was issued and advertised on January 8, 1997. On March 5, 1997, four (4) bids were received from the firms listed below:


<b><u>Contractor</u></b>	<b><u>Price</u></b>
Elevator Specialty Corp.	\$475,000
Montgomery KONE	492,777
Dover Elevators	590,959
US Elevator Corp.	754,470

The lowest bidder, Elevator Specialty Corporation, did not comply with the Small Business-Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) requirement at the time of the bid opening. Therefore, their bid was rejected. Montgomery KONE was found to be in compliance with all bid requirements and is, therefore, the lowest responsible, responsive bidder.

## **DBE PARTICIPATION**

The DBE participation goal for this procurement is 20 percent. Montgomery KONE exceeded the participation requirement by committing to 22 percent participation through the use of the MTA-certified firm of Quality Elevator Products.

Prepared by: Hussein Farah, Acting Facilities Maintenance Manager

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ellen G. Levine  
Executive Officer, Transit Operations

Procurement: Modernization of Three (3) Metro Blue Line Hydraulic Elevators at Slauson, Firestone, and Del Amo Stations  
 Board Date: May 28, 1997

BOARD REPORT ATTACHMENT "A"  
 PROCUREMENT SUMMARY  
 SEALED BID

1.	Recommended Vendor								
	Name: : Montgomery KONE								
	City: Gardena, CA								
	Total Dollar Amount: \$492,777.00								
2.	Description of Equipment or Material: Modernization of Three (3) Metro Blue Line Hydraulic Elevators at Slauson, Firestone, and Del Amo Stations								
3.	Issued and Advertised: January 8, 1997								
4.	DBE Participation Goal: 20% Responsive? Yes								
5.	No. of Bids Picked up by Vendors: 10								
6.	No. of bids opened: 4								
7.	No. of bids received:4								
8.	Staff analysis:								
	<p>1. List Bidders and Bid Prices</p> <table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 80%;">Elevator Specialty Corp.</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$475,000.00 •</td> </tr> <tr> <td><u>Montgomery KONE</u></td> <td style="text-align: right;"><u>\$492,777.00</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dover Elevators</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$590,959.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>U.S. Elevator Corp.</td> <td style="text-align: right;">\$754,470.00</td> </tr> </table> <p>• Contractor did not meet the DBE certification requirements</p> <p>The lowest bidder Elevator Specialty Corporation, was not a certified DBE at the time of the bid opening. Therefore they are found non compliant.</p> <p>Montgomery Kone, Inc. was found to be in compliance with all bid requirements and are therefore is the lowest responsible, responsive bidder.</p>	Elevator Specialty Corp.	\$475,000.00 •	<u>Montgomery KONE</u>	<u>\$492,777.00</u>	Dover Elevators	\$590,959.00	U.S. Elevator Corp.	\$754,470.00
Elevator Specialty Corp.	\$475,000.00 •								
<u>Montgomery KONE</u>	<u>\$492,777.00</u>								
Dover Elevators	\$590,959.00								
U.S. Elevator Corp.	\$754,470.00								
	<p>2. Tech Analysis-Responsiveness</p> <p>Evaluation By Lerch Bates - April 14, 1997</p> <p>Facilities Maintenance April 22, 1997</p>								
9.	Protest Received: yes								
	Disposition of Protest/Appeal: Rejected April 3, 1997								
10.	Award to Other than Low Bid? Why? Yes - Elevator Specialty Corp. was not a certified DBE at the time of the bid opening. Therefore they are found non compliant.								

11.	Conflict of Interest form submitted to Ethics? N/A
12.	EO Evaluation Completed: Yes March 12, 1997
13.	Audit Report Status: N/A
14.	Contract Administrator Thomas Meng, C.P.M. Tel: (213) 922-1074
15.	Project Manager: Hussein Farah Tel: (213) 922-6677

Concur: Margaret McHugh  
 Manager, Procurement

Concur: [Signature]  
 Director, Procurement