



Metropolitan  
Transportation  
Authority

One Gateway Plaza  
Los Angeles, CA  
90012-2952

13

13

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE  
FEBRUARY 16, 2000

**SUBJECT: CONTRACTED SERVICE STATUS REPORT - 2nd QUARTER  
FY 00**

**ACTION: RECEIVE AND FILE**

**RECOMMENDATION**

Receive and file the attached 2nd Quarter FY 00 performance status report on MTA Contracted Bus Service providers.

**ISSUE**

In September 1998, staff was directed to report back to the Board quarterly regarding the status of the performance of the contractors and other programmatic issues related to the program.

**BACKGROUND**

**Ryder/ATE**

ATE began operating 7 lines of bus service in March 1996. The lines of service are operated out of their Compton yard and run primarily in the Southern portion of the county. In a typical month, ATE provides 517,731 boardings per month. Lines 125, 130, 225, and 232, operated by Ryder/ATE, are among the 77 consent decree lines. The contract was amended to include performance incentives and disincentives beginning in June, 1999.

**Laidlaw**

The six lines operated by Laidlaw were originally contracted with Charterways which was purchased by Laidlaw in September 1996. Laidlaw consolidated operations of the service to Downtown L.A. On average, Laidlaw provides 181,394 boardings per month. Line 167, operated by Laidlaw, is one of the 77 consent decree lines. The contract was amended to include performance incentives and disincentives beginning in July, 1999.

## **Transportation Concept Incorporated (TCI)**

TCI was awarded a contract in February 1996 to provide service on three new service pilot lines: 603, 605, and 218. TCI provides services on all three lines with their own 27-foot coaches. However, due to demands on Line 605 and school schedules, two MTA owned 40-foot coaches have been provided to TCI to ensure demand is met.

## **DISCUSSION**

Transit Operations manages the above described service contracts with four dedicated staff members (currently understaffed by one field representative who will be hired by the end of January.) The field staff work closely with the contractors on ensuring day- to-day service requirements are met. The field staff attend morning roll-outs to view the on-time pull-out performance and discuss training issues, number of operators, down bus listings, and preventative maintenance programs with the contractors. The field staff monitor daily the quality of the service provided. Additionally, the field staff, along with the Manager of Contract Services, act as liaisons between the contractor and MTA departments, working in particular with the Scheduling Department on schedule changes or modifications and with Stops & Zones regarding bus stops and layover problems.

During this quarter a shakeup was held on December 5, and the Contract Services staff worked alongside the contractor and MTA's Scheduling Department to ensure changes in service went smoothly and did not impact the riding customers. Additionally during this quarter, Laidlaw was inspected by the California Highway Patrol (CHP). The CHP inspection resulted in an Unsatisfactory rating due to incomplete maintenance paperwork. All buses inspected were found to be in compliance. The Contract Service staff worked closely with the contractors on their documentation program and when the CHP returned, a Conditional rating (the highest possible rating after an Unsatisfactory rating) was given.

Additionally, Contract Services staff assisted Procurement Department in drafting and issuing a Request for Proposal for operation of 12 existing and 5 new service pilot lines. Proposals have been received and the recommended awards will be brought to the Board at the February and March meetings.

Below is a summary of each contractor's quarterly performance and contract status. During the 2nd quarter of FY00, each contractor reported an above average number of complaints, particularly in the month of October. The greatest number of complaints related to schedule adherence and reliability. It is important to note that these services are based on service frequencies of 30 minutes or more. Hence, the impact of a missed trip on our customers is far more significant than on service lines with greater frequencies. There is no question that the number of complaints is unacceptable. Staff is working with each contractor to identify the cause of complaints, especially schedule-related complaints, and to implement corrective action. Attachment A provides a monthly summary of complaints per contractor for the past six months.

## Ryder/ATE

ATE's performance for the 2nd Quarter of FY00 improved in on-time pull-out performance, as well as Miles Between Road Calls. However, ATE's on-time pull-out performance is not acceptable. During the quarter ATE had 31 cancellations of service and 127 outlates. In December alone, 20 cancellations were reported. The cancellations are a direct result of two items: 1) lack of management staff at the yard, and 2) a large number of inoperable buses. During December, the project manager and the maintenance manager were on vacation. No management was available or assigned to this project until the Contract Services Manager contacted ATE's corporate offices. The lack of appropriate management caused a degradation of service provided by ATE during the first part of December. This situation was discussed with project management at the January meeting between MTA Contract Services staff and the contractor and this will not occur again. Regarding the large number of down buses, ATE is in the process of changing their maintenance shift schedule.

Indicator	FY99 1st Quarter	FY99 2nd Quarter	FY99 3rd Quarter	FY99 4th Quarter	FY00 1st Quarter	FY00 2nd Quarter
On-Time Pullouts	94.59%	98.25%	96.18%	96.43%	99.41%	98.93%
Miles Between Road Calls	1,755	1,574	1,972	2,165	1,946	1,986
PMP's	0.6	0.74	0.84	0.44	0.62	1.06

ATE's contract expires on April 8, 2000. It is expected that the lines currently operated by ATE will be recommended for award at the February and March 2000 Board of Directors meetings. Additionally, \$14,850 in disincentives were applied for October and November, primarily for cancelled or incomplete trips, headsigns, fareboxes, accidents, and complaints. December's incentive and disincentive program will be applied to the invoice that is still outstanding.

## Laidlaw

Laidlaw's performance for the 2nd Quarter of FY00 improved significantly in on-time pull-out performance, while Miles Between Road Calls were at their lowest level since being reported. However, this is somewhat misleading. In the past, each contractor reported Miles Between Road Calls as defined by the company, not the MTA. During the 2nd quarter of FY00, staff worked closely with the contractors, resulting in more consistent reporting of Miles Between Road Calls<sup>1</sup> as defined by MTA. On-time pull-out performance, even though it has improved consistently over the last four quarters, is still not acceptable. During the quarter, Laidlaw had four cancellations of service and 70 outlates.

<sup>1</sup> Definition of Miles Between Road Calls according to the MTA: Total Hub Miles divided by Total Road Calls

Indicator	FY99 1st Quarter	FY99 2nd Quarter	FY99 3rd Quarter	FY99 4th Quarter	FY00 1st Quarter	FY00 2nd Quarter
On-Time Pullouts	93.84%	96.80%	92.58%	90.45%	95.42%	98.10%
Miles Between Road Calls	2,557	2,993	3,643	2,893	5,070	2,045
PMP's	0.16	0.09	1.01	0.00	0.01	0.03

Laidlaw's contract expires on April 8, 2000. It is expected that the lines currently operated by Laidlaw will be recommended for award at the February or March 2000 Board of Directors meeting. Additionally, \$7,850 of disincentives were applied for October and November combined, primarily for cancelled or incomplete trips, headsigns, fareboxes, accidents, and complaints. December's incentive and disincentive program will be applied to the invoice that is still outstanding.

## TCI

TCI's on-time pull-out performance for the past three quarters has been reported at slightly better than 94%. This is a reduction from previous quarters, which reported on-time pull-out performance above 97%. Note that for the last two quarters performance was based on MTA's definition. Previously it had been based on the contractor's definition. TCI has a total of 19 morning pullouts. In order to meet the current MTA goal of 99.5%, TCI cannot have more than three outlates or cancellations.

Indicator	FY99 1st Quarter	FY99 2nd Quarter	FY99 3rd Quarter	FY99 4th Quarter	FY00 1st Quarter	FY00 2nd Quarter
On-Time Pullouts	97.97%	97.25%	97.14%	94.70%	94.17%	94.82%
Miles Between Road Calls	14,792	8,422	19,963	n/a	13,512	9,621
PMP's	0.04	0.2	0.03	0	0	0

TCI's base contract expired on February 6, 1999. A one-year option was approved last year, with two one-year options available. In general, TCI has done a good job at responding to questions and issues regarding the quality of service they provide and in making modifications to their operations to result in improved service quality. As a result, MTA has executed the second year option, resulting in an expiration date of February 6, 2001.

**NEXT STEPS**

The Contract Services staff are focusing on two main objectives for the next quarter: 1) recommend award of the 12 lines operated by ATE and Laidlaw and the 5 pilot lines and 2) aggressively work with the contractors to reduce the number of complaints received.

Prepared by: Josee Larochelle  
Manager Operations Performance Analysis

Thomas Conner  
Thomas K. Conner  
Executive Officer *gpc/21*  
Transit Operations

\_\_\_\_\_  
Allan Lipsky  
Office of the Chief Executive Officer

## ATTACHMENT A

### Service Complaint Description for Laidlaw, Ryder/ATE, and TCI

Service Complaint Description	Laidlaw					
	July	August	September	October	November	December
Schedule Reliability No Show	37	51	19	30	25	16
Late or Early	7	10	8	5	7	7
Pass Ups	0	1	2	6	6	11
Unsafe Operation	4	5	3	3	1	2
Discourtesy	6	3	2	1	4	2
All Others	15	13	10	9	5	4
<b>Totals</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>42</b>

Service Complaint Description	Ryder/ATE					
	July	August	September	October	November	December
Schedule Reliability No Show	25	22	23	39	23	21
Late or Early	10	16	14	24	13	11
Pass Ups	6	12	7	14	13	11
Unsafe Operation	5	4	1	3	4	3
Discourtesy	4	11	3	3	3	7
All Others	10	14	12	8	7	7
<b>Totals</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>79</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>60</b>

Service Complaint Description	TCI					
	July	August	September	October	November	December
Schedule Reliability No Show	0	5	2	5	1	2
Late or Early	2	2	0	7	2	0
Pass Ups	1	6	1	5	3	2
Unsafe Operation	1	0	1	1	1	0
Discourtesy	2	0	2	0	1	3
All Others	1	2	2	1	0	4
<b>Totals</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>11</b>